Improving Tolerance and Pluralism in Schools Through Art and Culture-based Approaches
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Foreword</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>About Creative Youth for Tolerance (CREATE)</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CREATE National FGD: The Significant Roles of Educators in Promoting Tolerance and Pluralism</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CREATE Provincial FGD: Discussing Intolerance in the COVID-19 Pandemic</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CREATE Gender Analysis: How Indonesian Women Are Impacted by Intolerance</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virtual Art Camp in the COVID-19 Pandemic, Why Not?</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Training and Parent Learning Forum: Diversity, Art, and Youth</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#YouthChallenge: Promoting Peace, Celebrating Diversity</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**DISCLAIMER**

This newsletter is made possible by the generous support of the American people through the United States Agency for International Development (USAID). The contents are the responsibility of Yayasan Humanis dan Inovasi Sosial and do not necessarily reflect the views of USAID or the United States Government.
Diversity is a reality that has existed since the birth of Indonesia as a nation. The motto of Indonesia, “Bhinneka Tunggal Ika” (literally understood as “they are in pieces, (yet) they are one” or “unity in diversity”) as a mutual consensus has become the spirit of this nation as well as an affirmative form of the diversity of Indonesian society. However, diversity seems more as something idealized in the life of the nation than as a firm and comprehensive praxis of life.

The escalation of identity-based tensions rooted in discrimination and intolerance nowadays is very likely to occur due to the negligence of the urgency of managing diversity in our society. This form of negating the reality and the urgency of diversity management results in a bad effect on the survival of the nation and society.

Many records of events represent the problem of intolerance that is happening in Indonesia. From the tensions that rise when people of a certain religion want to build their own place of worship, massive hate speech in public, discriminative regulations against certain minority groups, the increase of fanaticism and absolutization of the truth which leads to radicalism that has penetrated into schools, to the most alarming extent: sporadic extremism.

Intolerance and discrimination in Indonesia are not merely incidents, they are rooted in long and dynamic historical-structural problems. We are not forging an empty space, instead we are standing in a real context that must be managed properly. In the end, it is inevitable that this initiative to promote dialogue and tolerance as one of the approaches to diversity management is the responsibility of all parties.

Obviously, there have been various initiatives and concrete works of stakeholders at the government, community, and private sector levels. However, allow us to introduce the ongoing Creative Youth for Tolerance (CREATE) program, which engages art and culture as transformative means. Through art and culture, CREATE builds space of encounter and explores contexts of diversity.

On behalf of the CREATE Consortium, we would like to express our gratitude to the Director General of Culture, the Ministry of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia, the Ministry of Religious Affairs, the Ministry of Social Affairs, the United States Agency for International Development (USAID), fellow civil society organizations, the mass media, schools, students, local communities, and all parties who have been supporting this program.

Best Regards,

Mohamad Miqdad
Project Manager CREATE
Yayasan Humanis dan Inovasi Sosial
(An affiliated organization of Hivos)
The Creative Youth for Tolerance (CREATE) program aims to improve pluralism and tolerance in schools using art and culture-based approaches. CREATE is designed to address alarming signs of intolerance and the promotion of exclusivism in the practice of religions and beliefs in schools that also threaten Indonesian democracy and values that respect diversity.

Artistic and cultural approaches are selected as the key entry points for the promotion of tolerance and pluralism among youth because these approaches are effective in building networks among diverse groups, providing social frameworks for the resolution of conflict as well as space for the development of shared experiences and cultural meanings among various groups. Artistic approaches can also provide a safe space for students to engage with sensitive issues of diversity, religious tolerance, gender equality and conflict, and imagine visions of a cooperative and peaceful future. CREATE is implemented in the provinces of West Java, South Sulawesi and East Java, where research has identified high levels of violations of religious freedom, as well as significant numbers of local regulations that are discriminatory toward women and minorities.

CREATE is a three-year program and has just completed its first year. In the first year, it was implemented by Yayasan Humanis dan Inovasi Sosial (an affiliated organization of Hivos), Yayasan Ganara Mariberbagi Seni (YGMS), Yayasan Cahaya Guru (YCG), and Pamflet Generasi as part of the CREATE Consortium, with support from The United States Agency for International Development (USAID).
The FGD results highlight the importance of involving educators in addressing the issues of intolerance in Indonesia. The civil society organizations involved in the FGD are those working in national level and most of them have headquarters in Jakarta.

These Focus Group Discussions resulted in several important findings. First, certain religious groups that promote tolerance messages at the same time could also commit intolerance practices. Intolerance is a systemic issue. Everyone has the responsibility to address intolerance. Intolerance is not only the responsibility of a small group of people who cause it, but also the responsibility of the society that lets intolerance happen.

Second, intolerance is a problem that has existed for a long time and will remain in the future. To overcome this problem a specific and effective approach is required. Intolerance is actually not the root of the problem itself. Instead, it is the fruit of corrupted fundamental values. Therefore, to overcome intolerance, we need to plant and nurture the fundamental values such as justice, equality, fairness and respect. These values are prerequisites for a peaceful environment that respect and accept each other.

W hy has intolerance become increasingly worrying and challenging to overcome? One of the reasons is - whether we want to admit it or not - the seeds of intolerance have spread in the education system in Indonesia. The result of the survey held by the Wahid Foundation in 2016 revealed that instructors of the students’ extracurricular religious activities showed high levels of support for perpetrators and acts of terrorism. Additionally, according to the survey conducted by the Center for the Study of Islam and Society (PPIM) at State Islamic University (UIN) in 2018, many high school students had intolerant views and were willing to fight for the so-called Islamic state.

The Focus Group Discussions (FGD) involving civil society organizations and representatives of the Government of Indonesia organized by CREATE in August and September 2020 intended to find a path to overcome the problem of intolerance in Indonesia. These discussions were conducted online considering that the condition of the COVID-19 pandemic in Indonesia has not yet subsided.

The FGD results highlight the importance of involving educators in addressing the issues of intolerance in Indonesia.

First, schools are expected to become not only places for students to learn, but also to practice the values of tolerance as mandated in Pancasila (five principles of Indonesian state philosophy: belief in one God, humanism, nationalism, democracy, and social justice), that needs to be understood in a more inclusive way. To cultivate the values of tolerance in schools, approaches based on local wisdom and cultures must be encouraged.

Second, school management needs to ensure that teachers uphold the values of tolerance, embrace religious inclusivism, and are capacitated to teach tolerance that includes not only religious identity, but also other diverse identities. Tolerance in the education sector must be viewed as an urgent need and addressed by various groups and stakeholders in Indonesia, and this view can be initiated by teaching the young generation that tolerance is inclusive.
Among the 34 provinces in Indonesia, there are three provinces with the highest number of cases of religious freedom, namely South Sulawesi, East Java and West Java. This data was obtained from the results of the SETARA Institute survey in 2019 with West Java province in the first place and South Sulawesi in the sixth. Similarly, East Java province has an index of Kerukunan Umat Beragama (KUB) or Religious Harmony below the national KUB index.

Amidst the COVID-19 pandemic, efforts to foster tolerance are jeopardized due to all the changes and uncertainties caused by the outbreak. Face-to-face meetings at schools are no longer allowed, while ideally students need space to learn how to interact in a diverse environment and practice tolerance.

To provide room for dialogue on this matter, CREATE held an online Focus Group Discussions (FGD) in September and October 2020 in the three provinces mentioned above. The events were attended by teachers from various schools, stakeholders related to the educational and religious matters, and civil society organizations. Below are some findings from the FGD regarding intolerance and the COVID-19 pandemic situation:

**WEST JAVA**
- Religious extremism is promoted in subtle yet intriguing ways in various sectors including education.
- News about COVID-19 dominates the media, resulting in underreporting cases of intolerance practices.
- The grievance mechanism in schools in West Java is not effective. As a result, students do not have a safe place to complain when they see intolerant behaviors around them.

**EAST JAVA**
- The media have a significant role in shaping public opinions including on the issue of intolerance.
- Students with disabilities are often considered “unable to do anything” at home even though they have been trained to do activities independently at school.
- One of the impacts of the pandemic is the decline in students’ empathy including expression of no condolences to those who passed away due to COVID-19. The learning from home method also makes it difficult for teachers to really know what happens to their students at home.

**SOUTH SULAWESI**
- Intolerance in South Sulawesi usually uses many “labels” ranging from race, feudalism, and political views.
- “Diversity” becomes a political tool that is played mainly by the power-holders during the Local Election.
- Student learning hours at home during the pandemic still follow face-to-face school hours. Teachers have difficulties in building and maintain a fun learning atmosphere online for the whole day.

The participants of the FGD suggested that campaign and promotion of tolerance through cultural, civic, and inclusive religious lessons as well as extracurricular activities in schools need to be encouraged. In addition, teachers have to play a greater role not only as educators, but also as role models in countering the values of intolerance that try to infiltrate deeper into the education system. The use of mainstream media and social media to spread pro-peace creative narrative also needs to be optimized, especially during the pandemic.
As a program that aims to encourage tolerant attitudes and enable a tolerant environment in schools, CREATE conducted a series of studies to get deeper understanding about how intolerance and discrimination has affected marginalized groups, especially women, in Indonesia. Tolerance is an attitude of accepting identities different from one's own identity. These differences are not limited to religious and cultural identities, but also social class, ethnic, political and gender identities. CREATE carried out the studies through literature reviews and online Focus Group Discussions (FGD) in South Sulawesi, West Java, and East Java from June to October 2020, which also covered comprehensive ecological aspects.

As a program that aims to encourage tolerant attitudes and enable a tolerant environment in schools, CREATE conducted a series of studies to get deeper understanding about how intolerance and discrimination has affected marginalized groups, especially women, in Indonesia. Tolerance is an attitude of accepting identities different from one's own identity. These differences are not limited to religious and cultural identities, but also social class, ethnic, political and gender identities. CREATE carried out the studies through literature reviews and online Focus Group Discussions (FGD) in South Sulawesi, West Java, and East Java from June to October 2020, which also covered comprehensive ecological aspects.

CREATE Gender Analysis: How Indonesian Women Are Impacted by Intolerance

The findings show that women in Indonesia are still more vulnerable to various acts of intolerance and discrimination. CREATE is committed to applying a gender responsive approach to ensure the value of inclusivity is integrated in the program implementation. The gender responsive approach is not intended to provide more benefits to women’s groups, but rather to ensure that women secure the same benefits as men regardless of their different circumstances.

FINDINGS

REGULATION

- There are 333 regulations at the regional level that are discriminatory against women which include curfews, dress code, and prohibition of prostitution
- The legal basis to protect women from violence is still weak; the Law on the Elimination of Sexual Violence has not been legalized either

PRACTICE

- In South Sulawesi and West Java, local regulations which require women students to wear a headscarf have caused students to feel intimidated when they are not willing to wear it
- The number of domestic violence against Indonesian-Chinese women has increased in the COVID-19 pandemic, and Indonesian-Chinese women are perceived as virus carriers so that people avoid interacting with them

ACCESS & PARTICIPATION

- Women still experience restrictions in getting equality in terms of education, employment, politics and health services. These lack women of bargaining power and increase their vulnerability to join extremist movement
- Women’s participation quota in politics of minimum of 30% is not fulfilled, only 20.87% of parliamentarians are women (Gender-Based Human Development Report, 2019)

TIME & OPPORTUNITY

- Women teachers and parents have more burdens in the pandemic because they have to work and do household chores which are perceived as “women’s duties”. Women students have to help their parents to do domestic works and even work while they learn from home.
- 70% of Indonesians believe that men should be more entitled to jobs than women during economic crisis (Pew Research Center, 2020)
One of the factors that drive intolerance in Indonesia is because people do not truly identify diversity as part of our national identity. Continuous efforts are needed to improve the understanding that diversity must be respected and accepted. Bearing this in mind, Yayasan Ganara Mariberbagi Seni (YGMS) as part of the CREATE Consortium held Virtual Art Camp in three provinces in Indonesia: South Sulawesi, West Java, and East Java.

125 students, of whom 79.2% are women students, from various schools participated in a three-day virtual art camp held in January to February 2021. Since the art camp was designed to increase understanding of tolerance and pluralism among youth through artistic approaches and enjoyable experience, the students were not only equipped with knowledge about tolerance and social inclusion, but also encouraged to create artworks incorporating messages of tolerance and equality.

On the first day, students were introduced to the concept of critical thinking and social inclusion and discussed various differences and perspectives they experienced and saw in everyday life. The discussion revealed that the students had concerns about the intolerance around them and came up with practical suggestions to address this issue. For example, men students tend to be prioritized in the student council elections. Students suggested that schools should create regulations that prohibit such discrimination and allow equal opportunities to women in student council elections.

On the second day, the participants learned about gender equality and social inclusion as well as the role of art in conveying messages about social issues. In the gender equality and social inclusion session delivered by Martha Hebi, a well-known artist and feminist from Sumba, East Nusa Tenggara, students asked questions about women’s emancipation, gender equality and LGBT issues. “Emancipation is the process of giving power to women who are treated as second-class citizens in […] Indonesia. Gender injustice does not only happen to a few women, but to many women,” Martha replied. She further said that when we talked about human rights, everyone should be given equal treatment regardless of their sexual orientation. Martha also discussed painful discrimination against marginalized groups such as followers of the Merapu religion (a local religion practiced in Sumba), and violence against women that occurred in the practice of “Kawin Tangkap” (Marriage by Abduction) in Sumba.

In the art session, Ika Vantiani, a prominent collage artist based in Jakarta, explained how art could be used for creative social movement campaigns. Through their artworks, artists are able to present “old” messages that are commonly known in fresh perspectives. Ika reminded students that, even though art provides an unlimited space for exploration, the message may only be understood by a limited audience. This is because everyone’s taste and understanding of art is unique. At the end of the session, the students created an artwork using collage techniques to practice what they had learned.

On the last day of the art camp, students worked in groups to create a creative campaign promoting the values of tolerance and pluralism, social inclusion, and gender equality. The media used by the students varied from traditional art media such as paper and canvas for paintings and posters, to digital media such as digital posters, Instagram story videos, photo grids, podcasts, and photo videos.

Through this activity, at least 24 selected artworks promoted the values of tolerance, pluralism, gender equality, and social inclusion. The production process of 87.5% of the selected artworks was led by women students. The selected works were exhibited in the CREATE Virtual Exhibition from March 23 to March 30, 2021.
The poster promotes pluralism and tolerance, particularly toward gender diversity. The statement on the poster shows respect for different gender identities and supports people to be true to themselves and embrace their gender identities.

Poster by:
Agastya Damas, Aghnia Tias, Keyni Mahardika, Naufallah Tegar, Ilmi Dwi, and Auliya Malika (East Java)

This persuasive poster is created with the hope that it can help audiences understand that there is diversity among ethnic groups and all groups within society.

Poster by:
Ikhfar, Ruhiatman, Yesica, Qurroh, Winya, and Widyadhana (West Java)

The collage centers around the image of the goddess Athena depicting a bright, strong woman. Since ancient times and even now, women have always been underestimated. Therefore, the artist added the statement, “I’d rather be tired than broke” to express her willingness “to be tired” in the struggle to increase her self-esteem as a woman rather than doing nothing and being belittled or underestimated by others.

Collage by:
Ukhraeni (South Sulawesi)
As teachers hold an important role in strengthening tolerance among Indonesian students, CREATE Consortium member organization Yayasan Cahaya Guru (YCG) arranged a series of training for teachers with the theme, “Celebrating Diversity through Art.” This training aimed to increase teachers’ understanding of tolerance and diversity and skills to promote and pass the values to their students. The training was held online for two months (from October to November 2020). Participants are teachers from 10 different provinces in Indonesia.

For the training, YCG invited resource persons who are qualified in their respective fields such as Henny Supolo (Founder of Yayasan Cahaya Guru), Komar (Teacher in SMA Al Izhar Pondok Labu), and Mayong Febionesta (Head of Organizational Development at YLBHI Indonesia/Indonesian Legal Aid Foundation). YCG built the discussions of tolerance and pluralism around arts in four training sessions: Art, Diversity, and Our Future; Arts in Educational and Cultural Philosophy; Arts and Diversity Management; Celebrating Diversity Through Art. The training materials were delivered through lectures and simulations that utilized art approaches. In each session, participants thought and discussed how they would apply the knowledge acquired during the training in their classrooms, in ways that would be suitable for the subjects that they taught (contextualization strategy).

Following each training session, participants received mentoring sessions via WhatsApp and Google Classroom. In these mentoring sessions, participants were encouraged to reflect on the training materials and create artworks conveying messages of tolerance. Three selected works were exhibited in the CREATE Virtual Exhibition from March 23 to March 30, 2021, along with works of youth participants of other CREATE activities.

Teacher Training Participants’ Selected Works

Memaknai Toleransi dari Kearifan Lokal / Interpreting Tolerance from Local Wisdom

Prose by Hery S.Q, Al Quran and Hadith teacher Madrasah Aliyah Madani Alauddin, Gowa, South Sulawesi.

In Hery S. Q.’s work, the author defines tolerance as a space to respect the uniqueness of each individual in the context of Gowa’s value Sirik na pacce. Sirik means ashamed of doing sinful or wrongful things and Pacce means unconditional love. In Gowa culture, the principles of Sipakaliga (reminding each other), Sipakalabbi (mutual respect), Sipakatau (humanizing, honoring, appreciating each other) are part of an effort to interpret tolerance.
In addition to training for teachers, Yayasan Cahaya Guru also held Forum Belajar Pendidik (FBP) or Educator’s Learning Forum. FBP was held virtually five times and was delivered for two main groups of audience: three sessions for teachers and two sessions for parents. Ki Hajar Dewantara’s philosophy of education is the foundation for all materials and discussions in these FBP sessions. According to Ki Hajar Dewantara, there are three philosophies of education that shapes our humanity: education of mind (intelligence), education of will (motivation), and education of feelings (well-being). Art is part of the education of feelings.

In FBP for teachers, participants learned how to use art approaches, including traditional songs or artworks from different parts in Indonesia, to introduce diversity in the classroom. In FBP for parents, the session drew a conclusion that art is an important medium for teenagers to discover their potential and express their feelings. Ifa H. Misbach, one of the speakers in the FBP highlighted the importance of maintaining parents’ relationships with children using art-based approaches, “Art can also change a situation, and it starts with a change in mindset. When our thoughts have changed, our emotions have changed, then our acts will also change.”

Process of creating a beautiful artwork. Similarly, students are individuals who already have their own “colors.” Each student has their own character and talent and has been shaped by different circumstances and environments. When a teacher understands that students are unique, learning process can become a more enjoyable process that maximizes students’ potential.
The rise of identity politics, particularly religious identity politics, in Indonesia is a factor that deteriorates social cohesion among its people. Ethnic identities and religions are often abused to trigger the practice of intolerance. To address this, Pamflet Generasi as part of the CREATE Consortium held #YouthChallenge from December 2020 to February 2021. #YouthChallenge is an art competition for high school students in Indonesia to promote tolerance and pluralism values. This year the competition’s theme was Tolerance and Pluralism Among Young People.

CREATE received artwork submissions from 182 students. 60 students whose artworks passed the selection stage were invited to participate in class drilling sessions, virtual field visits, and a workshop. These activities aimed to improve participants’ understanding and attitudes on gender equality, social inclusion, respect for diversity, and use of art in social campaigns. The selected participants also got the space to collaborate with fellow participants and representatives from local marginalized communities.

Class Drilling

Class drilling sessions were held twice online: the first class focused on the topics of Tolerance, Pluralism, Gender Equality, and Social Inclusion, while the second class discussed the themes of Art Activism (Artivism) and Social Campaigns. Alissa Wahid (National Coordinator GUSDURian Network Indonesia), Khanza Vina (Transgender Activist), Renato Adhitama (Comic Artist), Wanggi Hoed (Mime Artist), and Lindawati Sumpena (Project Coordinator Peace Generation Indonesia) were some of the resource persons at the class drilling. During the sessions, participants were encouraged to share their original artworks and discuss their experiences and thoughts on the topics.

Virtual Field Visit

In addition to class drilling, participants also “visited” and got to know vulnerable and marginalized groups: participants watched documentary videos that Pamflet had prepared in advance and had discussions with vulnerable and marginalized groups. Three groups involved in the Virtual Field Visits are the AKUR Sunda Wiwitan Community (an indigenous belief community located in Kuningan, West Java), the Mata Hati Community (a community of people with vision impairment in East Java), and the Bissu Community (priests of Bugis community in South Sulawesi whose gender is perceived as a mixture of man and woman). Through this virtual field visit, participants learned that marginalized groups exist and live around them. Since everyone shares the same community and environment, these marginalized communities have to be respected.
After the participants were equipped in class drilling sessions and virtual field visits, Pamflet organized a design thinking workshop and mentoring session. In these activities, participants were encouraged to further develop their ideas and improve their artworks to deliver stronger messages of tolerance and pluralism. In the mentoring session, participants had the opportunity to consult and discuss with the mentors. Participants were split into two groups based on their artworks: visual art sessions were mentored by Ika Vantiani and Angga Wijaya, and literature artwork (prose and poems) sessions were mentored by Dhianita Kusuma Pertiwi and Edo Wallad.

At the launching of the #YouthChallenge Art Catalogue that was held online on February 27, 2021, #YouthChallenge received appreciation from both the Ministry of Education and Culture and the United States Agency for International Development (USAID). Dr. Hilmar Farid, Director General of the Ministry of Education and Culture, said in his speech, “In general, cultural approach is a very effective approach to overcome differences, challenges and obstacles that we face in a very diverse society. I support this activity because, through this activity, we are trying to find ways on how young people can use art to overcome differences.”

Meanwhile, Walter Doetsch, USAID Democratic Resilience and Governance Office Director, said that the United States and Indonesia shared the same values: democracy, tolerance, and peace. “Both of our countries understand that young people can play a critical role in promoting tolerance, which is why the U.S. Government, through the United States Agency for International Development is pleased to support today’s Youth Challenge, which encourages young Indonesians to use art to promote tolerance and diversity -- which are fundamental to freedom and dignity.”

The #YouthChallenge Art Catalogue is available for download on the last page of this newsletter.

All of the series of #YouthChallenge was finally concluded with the announcement of the winners of the competition. The selected three winners were as follows:

**Kita Semua Sama / We are All the Same**
Drawing pen by Winya Ajhra Prathami (Bandung, West Java)

This work describes how tolerance and respect for diversity can be applied in everyday life including in schools.

Explore more of Winya’s ideas on page 28 of #YouthChallenge Art Catalogue.
Prompted by my concerns about bullying, this unique work was born. This work is a poetry that voices, embraces, and reaches out to the diverse ones. I raised this concept of Rwa Bhineda (two different/opposite things) as the universal main theme. This poetry is arranged, verse by verse, by employing depersonification figure of speech and some symbolisms.

Read I Wayan Ivan Senatmaja’s poetry on page 56 of #YouthChallenge Art Catalogue.

This song is about our views on differences. Many of us consider differences as taboo while it actually depends on how we perceive it. If we appreciate differences, positive things will come to us. On the contrary, disregarding differences will lead us to get negative results.

Listen to the song by Riska Zulpiana and Inu Kencana by clicking on the link on page 63 of #YouthChallenge Art Catalogue.

Prompted by my concerns about bullying, this unique work was born. This work is a poetry that voices, embraces, and reaches out to the diverse ones. I raised this concept of Rwa Bhineda (two different/opposite things) as the universal main theme. This poetry is arranged, verse by verse, by employing depersonification figure of speech and some symbolisms.

Read I Wayan Ivan Senatmaja’s poetry on page 56 of #YouthChallenge Art Catalogue.